

- 00:00:15.37 **CAMILA PALOMINO:** Hi, everyone. Thank you for joining us and sharing your afternoon with us here on the first Zoom Speaker Series. Before we get started, I just want to thank you, Lauren, for encouraging us to organize and carry out a Speaker Series as we move into this remote sphere. And thank you, Georgie, for coordinating our involvement and Casey for making this virtual setup run so smoothly. So I'm really happy that today for the first series, we have both Tom Keenan and Pelin Tan joining us. Thank you two for making time to speak with us. I'll give a brief introduction, although I know Tom and Pelin are familiar to many of you. Tom Keenan is the Associate Professor of Comparative Literature and Director of the Human Rights program here at Bard College, along with being a visiting faculty member at CCS. He has published several books, including "Fables of Responsibility" and "Mengele's Skull", written with Eyal Weisman. In 2010 he co-curated "Antiphotjournalism" with Carles Guerra.
- 00:01:30.01 Pelin Tan is the current Keith Haring Fellow here at CCS. She's a Sociologist, Art Historian and researcher. In 2011, she was a Postdoctoral Fellow in the MIT program in Art, Culture and Technology, and she was Associate Professor and Vice Dean at the Architecture Faculty at Mardin Artuklu University in Mardin, Turkey. Pelin is involved in artistic and architectural projects that focus on urban conflict, territorial politics and conditions of labor that we'll speak about more. She's a member of the Artıkişler Collective, The Silent University, and has participated in many exhibitions and biennials, most recently the Chicago Architecture Biennial in 2019. So thank you two again. I guess we'll have about forty five minutes or so of presentation and discussion and then we'll open it up for questions from everyone and have an open discussion. So I'm going to go ahead and mute myself and let you guys begin.
- 00:02:40.83 **PELIN TAN:** I'm trying to... I'm starting to talk, isn't it? I mean, one second, I'm trying to understand how to... Do you hear me, Camila?
- 00:02:51.16 **THOMAS KEENAN:** Yeah, we can hear you.
- 00:02:53.070 **PELIN TAN:** I'm sorry. I talk to nobody... OK, now I'm OK. So, Camila, how are we going to open the presentation? You open or, I share, share contents. One second... I'm sorry for this... Zoom. No. OK, sorry, I use Google Meet a lot. Not Zoom so much.
- 00:03:24.26 **THOMAS KEENAN:** Who is the host of the meeting? Is it Casey? Casey?
- 00:03:29.05 **CASEY ROBERTSON:** Yes.
- 00:03:29.73 **THOMAS KEENAN:** It may be that Casey needs to share his screen to show the presentation.
- 00:03:34.28 **CASEY ROBERTSON:** I have it set so that any user can share their screen.
- 00:03:38.45 **THOMAS KEENAN:** Brilliant.
- 00:03:39.29 **CASEY ROBERTSON:** I can also make both of you hosts, just in case that makes things easier.
- 00:03:47.92 **THOMAS KEENAN:** OK.

- 00:03:48.47 **PELIN TAN:** Casey, I'm not able to share. Do a Google Drive? Yes, I will be glad if someone can open...
- 00:03:58.72 **LAUREN CORNELL:** Maybe Casey, could you share it, since Tom will be an interlocutor?
- 00:04:02.80 **PELIN TAN:** Oh, yes. Yes, this will be great. Because it needs a password if I want to share, it needs a password. And it will take so much time, I think.
- 00:04:14.19 **CASEY ROBERTSON:** OK, one moment.
- 00:04:17.88 **PELIN TAN:** And I follow from my own drive, is it OK?
- 00:04:24.57 **CASEY ROBERTSON:** Yes, that should be fine, let's see. Here we are.
- 00:04:37.12 **PELIN TAN:** OK, OK, great. Thank you, Casey, because I just went out from another class and I was using something else. I'm sorry, I'm a little bit, not so much and I'm learning this, using online. I would like to thank you for inviting us to discuss. To present and discuss today. And I was thinking, I can share maybe what I'm doing as a research-based, why I'm interested in infrastructures and why I call the threshold, why we I call it care and what is mainly the methodologies, what I'm interested in.
- 00:05:26.83 I am from a Sociology background. My my BA is in Sociology. And I studied art history, Master and PhD and I worked in Art History Department in Istanbul Technical University for ten years. And then I really left. I said, I cannot do this Art History anymore. And I'm not also so much into Sociology. So I had always difficulty in terms of engagement, community engagement, any kind of engagement in movement and struggle. How I can position myself as a researcher with my background coming from Art History and Sociology that both disciplines sometimes is obstacle for me in order to use and find the methodologies of engagement.
- 00:06:18.84 And so I have... I just want to quickly inform that, say that because I'm struggling, I was struggling and still I'm struggling a lot. This is... I worked in Architecture faculties in general. I'm not an architect, but I found a job in Architecture faculty by coincidence. And then in 2000, I was always in the Architecture faculties and I've become more also involved in architectural practice with my friends, architects. But looking from different perspective, in terms of infrastructure, it become... The second slide you will see.
- 00:06:55.32 I have some question and what I'm focusing on. First, I work, I'm based in territories that is always, there's a conflict, either war, post-war, civil war or conflict in urban space. And this condition is very difficult to proceed in research and pedagogy on infrastructure, because infrastructure is always either architectural, institutional, in any form in this kind of territory. It is always involved with structural violence, is very much involved censorship. It's very involved with different kinds of obstacles that as a practitioners, if you are in this kind of condition, is really hard to proceed with certain methodologies in the field, a certain kind of engagement in the community.
- 00:08:05.96 And I have always this kind of question, how I can find in certain territories design, art and architectural methodologies and how I can research by researching how through research and engagement I can find active forms and how I can activate. There is always... I just want to say that I wasn't a freelancer. I think it's important to say. I was always an academic. I had a full-time academic work since 2000 and I had a full time salary, always.

- 00:08:55.97 I had not so much a precarious condition. I mean, of course the level of precarity is a question too. In Turkey, everything when you look from here, everything can be very precarious. But if you have a full-time academic job, you are a little bit in that kind of a safe position in Turkey until if you don't face a kind of a freedom of speech issue, if you don't face a battle with the government, with state, Turkey state. So, I don't want to go so deep into that, but I want to just share a few of my research and then we can discuss over that.
- 00:09:37.25 My presentation is long and I'm trying to make it very quick. I was using some reference in the second and third slide about what is infrastructure, how we understand. And you see that I am referring to Keller's work. I think all of us know her book and how she's describing infrastructure as an active medium. And the second... I am very much interested in following Colin Macfarlane, he's an urbanist from England, and he worked a lot on Bombay, on India. And he was working with Stephen Graham a lot on broken infrastructure, infrastructure that fails. For example, Colin in one article was talking about, I can share later the references to a student, that failed infrastructure sometimes creates a different kind of network, more a kind of even great creative network.
- 00:10:36.32 So when he was talking about failures of infrastructures, he was referring to the water system in Bombay, in India, that he was researching on urban infrastructures and how they fail and not work, but create a different kind of community network that supports or brings solidarity and different kinds of networks. And I'm interested to work on this perspective. This is, of course, the scale is urban here. One day. When Colin and Stephen Graham talks or writes about. And I like a lot of Elizabeth's work on geontologies, that brings a lot of different... Opens, a different discussion and spaces about colonial practices in different territories and future issues on climate justice and Anthropocene.
- 00:11:39.50 I think this whole bunch of reference is... I'm still reading and understanding and trying to inform my research on that. The fifth slide, I put some of my research may be non... Most of you maybe doesn't know. It's to still be continued. This is a research... I structured this research finding first the fishing villages in Pearl River Delta and looking to fisherwoman. How they are creating a small-scale of design in their villages and also in different scale of the villages, spatial scale of the villages. I was saying that I was trying to find the villages because... Here the sixth slide, you will see, it was not so easy to find the villages in the Pearl River Delta. I mean Pearl River Delta is, you might know, is one of the important geographical scale that is under huge urbanization, surrounded with five cities, five, six cities.
- 00:13:01.17 And it is also very much contaminated. And most fisherwomen and fishermen cannot even go to fishing anymore. If they have to go they have to go really far to Hong Kong-China borders. And go beyond this border and fish and come back. So there was two issues here that I wanted to learn. One was that, if we go back to the fifth slide, to really reach those fisherwoman, not fishermen, and trying to understand how with their body and hands are still producing material. And first I needed to find those villages, is not only the language problem, but is also nobody knows those villages, even the Chinese people.
- 00:13:53.13 So I have to really do a lot of walking to find them and then identify in a mapping where those villages are and so on. In the seventh slide, you see that a woman is using her body in order to produce fishing nets. This is a kind of a tradition that is disappearing as the villages are facing huge problems, infrastructural projects like bridges and highways between Hong Kong and Macao, between Hong Kong and China. And there are many new social housing, new cities are coming up.

- 00:14:35.79 Also in those, in geography, like around the villages, between the villages, that is [INAUDIBLE] also to the transportation system between the villages. This is how is also very difficult to find them. Eight and nine, slide eight and nine, you will see some structures of gardening and the living spaces. And then on the slide nine, you see a huge bridge is coming up. I think the bridge is already constructed, which is coming directly, going about the most oldest fishing village in Pearl River Delta. This is slide that's showing. In the tenth slide. I'm very much looking in research. I like to look a lot of female labor.
- 00:15:27.14 I feel if you learn a daily cycle of a female labor and the reproduction of it, I understand better how the space is functioning, how the other knowledges around the space or other kind of knowledge production that makes up the space or the infrastructure is for me, more easy, open to understand. In slide tenth, you see a map. I use this mapping a lot.
- 00:15:56.12 This is a mapping by diverse, it's diverse economies by Gibson-Graham, Julie Gibson and Katharine Graham and Julie Gibson. They're both economists, feminist geographers. They wrote a few big books. One of them is "A Postcapitalist Politics". I like their work a lot. I follow a lot. I mean, Judy Gibson died, but they're still producing books. A new book came out called "Diverse Economies", just this month. I couldn't reach the book. But just for your information, if you're interested and I can send later information too.
- 00:16:39.49 In slide eleven. I do a lot of self-map to understand what I'm doing, because sometimes in my research and in different kind of territories that I'm working, I get really lost. But always I see similar symptoms. Big infrastructural projects run a state-run or company-run, creating oppressive network. Creating a different kind of power relation that really destroys the area or other humans.
- 00:17:18.65 So in this slide 11, you see how I understand field. I was really... When I moved to Mardin, to the city in southeast of Turkey from Istanbul, my understanding of scale and infrastructure changed, transformed. I was working always in Istanbul in urban context, in a neighborhood scale and the neighborhood struggle, urban transformation, projects that are threatening in communities and so on. When I moved to Mardin, which is very like 20 minutes to the Syrian border... You can see in slide 12, it became more confusing for me to understand what a scale is.
- 00:18:11.40 Are we speaking about a scale of a refugee tent? Are speaking about a scale of a town, village, neighborhood, territory? And I started to really think how in order to understand some infrastructural effect, I need to really be flexible between scales. So I started to work, especially nowadays more how I understand about scale. What is the scale of commons? What is the scale of infrastructure? What is the scale of research? I think it's important and I'm working on that more simply.
- 00:18:53.03 In slide, 12, 13, and if you continue, 14, 15, you will see that. When I started to work in the architecture faculty that we founded in Mardin, our aim was to introduce a socially-engaged pedagogy in architecture. And also inviting contemporary artists and being more near to artistic practice and thinking together with those practices. This is something lacking in other architecture faculties in Ankara and Istanbul. And this is why many of us resigned from our job position in Istanbul and moved to this faculty.
- 00:19:36.23 And this was a very difficult experience. I did run the faculty, too, and there was two levels for me. One level was that, I really, with my colleagues together, we wanted to establish this faculty, but we were in a really oppressive territory and we just moved in 2013 when the peace process between Turkish government and Kurdish movement started. So we wanted to really contribute

to the peace process in this region. And we thought introducing a kind of socially engaged architecture and arts pedagogy and serving the region by having mostly the students from this region, like Arabic and Kurdish students, and really try to bring a different kind of practices and discussion.

- 00:20:36.93 It was very difficult. We had a lot of pressure by the very conservative administration of the university, also from the region. So it was really difficult to really hold on, especially if you're a Dean. You need to really have taken certain decisions. And censorship and oppression and threatening is really hard in this region that we faced. And we have to run under this condition. But we made very important...
- 00:21:15.28 We did run important studios and projects. And the aim to really bring the students who are mostly from villages and who are really traumatized in this region, but they want to be an architect or they want to be in the field of art. In this slide 13, it was the year 2013, the beach started to receive a lot of Syrian refugees. And in slide 13, you see that my students produced some proposals of public spaces and some little design gestures of creating spaces of commons. In one of the biggest refugee camp, which was 40 minutes away from us, we managed to enter this camp and try to understand what public space means for them. It was the coincidence that this camp was designed by my Master's student who was working in the ministry a Kurdish architect. And they used a typical planning that is given from United Nations.
- 00:22:27.60 I think a plan, a design, that is kind of a typical camp design. And it was not working for the Muslim Arabs, for the Christian Arabs, for the Yazidis. So there was a lot of ethnic and religious differences among the immigrants that the public space was functioning differently. In the next slide, 14. We worked in a self-organized camp. So there was two camps. One was state-run camp, still are many, 30 around in southeast of Turkey.
- 00:23:02.42 And then there was many self-organized camps that was mostly done, organized, by the Yazidi communities. And these camps were near Mardin, and in a kind of a green landscape, like a natural place. And the people were mostly from **[INAUDIBLE]** who came. In that period we had to open, for instance, immigrants coming. I mean, I had to, I hosted young Syrian refugees who didn't have a place to go. I mean, as a Dean I have to open my faculty and I hosted them in our places. And besides that, art galleries and sports centers... very, very strange accommodation that happened at the time that it was very interesting to see.
- 00:24:04.05 Also, an art gallery was hosting refugees who were sleeping in the gallery among the exhibition. So we were in this kind of situation that the government is trying to accommodate. And we are also trying to help because everything was happening around us. In this camp we spent a few workshops and a few terms. I engaged this study in the Architectural Design Studio Master and we spent a lot of time here in order to understand how this camp is functioning. In slide 16, you see the actors in the camp. We try to first understand what kind of actors are existing in the camp. And then, in slide 17, we started to... I told the students... Because the students asked me, are we going to design the camp?
- 00:25:06.94 I said no, because the camp is already designed and self-made by the refugees. What are we going to do? We will archive architecture and using architectural methodology and analyzing and creating an archive. So we produced a kind of a PDF archive. This camp doesn't exist anymore. It was one and a half years. Self-organized, with many gardens, planting and the self-made dwellings. You can see in slide 18, slide 19, slide 20, slide 21. And we focus again on the Yazidi woman, how they are creating their life there.

- 00:25:47.91 Mostly there were some architectural elements that was built by them, like corridors that are connecting, and the tents, each other, in order to create semi-public spaces. They can sit in those spaces. I have some videos, but I cannot show right now. But this was something very important to understand. Even an element, the scale of corridor, how it is produced by the woman in what needs in a camp. I think a lot of learning from them as a student, as me, who are interested in self-design and the spaces of commons. We went...
- 00:26:35.32 In slide 22 you will see. We continued this. I mean, me in my classes, in my studios. I took my students to Lesbos Island, for people refugee camp. There is two camps, one is a state camp, **[INAUDIBLE]** a biggest camp, which is a kind of a detention center. And then there is a solidarity self-organized by refugees camp that receives refugees who are staying there temporary, and how those refugees, after, they continue to Athens. In slide 22, 23, you will see we were really, again, happy to see that house farming and cultivation was important. A daily practice not only about receiving vegetables and food, but also as a kind of reproductive labor that was taking place in those self-organized camps as a daily practice.
- 00:27:34.16 24, 25 slide, you will see we went to Palestine to meet Alessandro Petti and Sandi Hilal. This trip was very important for my Kurdish students because we had the chance to compare the means of colonization between Palestine and southeast of Turkey. How biopolitics is being formed through different kinds of spaces. And we were very lucky. David Harvey joined us in our trip and we had a three-day workshop about... Called "Autonomous Infrastructure". So we try to understand how in an emergency situation, how under oppression, how under severe violent colonization, how alternative infrastructure comes up, alternative kind of, alternative networks comes up and how they function and how they can be sustained.
- 00:28:37.12 In **[INAUDIBLE]** workshop, especially in slide 25, we will see. We did run in all of our Palestinian refugee camp woman centers. And this was something also to support the woman who are running the center. You will see. You see in the slide, on the top, on the roof is so, like, the dropping water. They created a garden, a vegetable garden. So again, we saw.. I mean, the vegetable garden and cultivation became more, how I can say, not only a reality of connecting those different kind of infrastructures, but a kind of a metaphor to follow.
- 00:29:26.76 And I want to shift to a few more examples of how we transferred those kind of knowledge about infrastructure, labor, and scale. Last year, on the first of May, I was invited by the Architecture Chamber of Gaziantep. Antep is a city near the border just near to Kobani. And Antep is a big city and full of Syrian migrants and refugees, not only in camps, also in the city. They live in the city. So in the slides 26, 27, I transformed into a workshop and I had students from Antep, Architecture students. And when the Chamber of Architects invited me, they wanted me to do a workshop on architects and labor. The labor condition about architects. This is a new discussion coming up in Turkey, in the Architecture and Design field.
- 00:30:29.72 And I told them, you are in Antep, Antep is full of refugees, all in agricultural fields. They are precarious refugee labor. And all poor Syrians who came, who crossed the border and came to Antep are working on shitty jobs, collecting trash and all other things. And how can you see separated a labor of an architect, than a labor of, a refugee labor. So they were so surprised to hear that, they said that they never thought about that. And I did run this workshop with my students, Master's students to bring them, also to make them share.
- 00:31:12.59 And undergrad students you see in slide 26 and 27. The students, they told me they never heard this kind of entangled way of understanding of labor and space. And they came up, after two days, with two proposals of transforming an empty train station into a refugee camp, a kind

of a refugee housing project. And the slide 27 is Turkish, maybe I should translate. But it is a nice project by a female urban planner who came up with the mapping women houses, women solidarity houses in Antep, both refugee and non refugee woman.

- 00:32:00.16 This was very interesting. I did run the workshop both into cultural space of the Chamber of Architects and another space is a solidarity immigrant NGO. So I collaborated with them. So I was doing two things: bringing our experience from Mardin, from Palestine, from Athens, from Lesbos to do workshops and also trying to understand what is going on in Antep. I feel everything is very much related, all those territories and all those practices.
- 00:32:39.52 In the slide 28, I shared the article "The Scale of Commons and Solidarity Infrastructure." When Chicago architecture editors, curators, asked me to write something about commons, I said, Can I write about an example in Athens? Which was I think around three years a occupied hotel, empty hotel, by activists, Greek activists who accommodated around 120 Syrian families in one night. They did run the space. I was visiting the space a lot, and it was very difficult to occupy and establish a place to live together as activists and families of refugees. And they managed to sustain the space. And that means, like, finding food every day, cooking, bringing the children to the school, many, many work that needs labor, collective labor and collective decision. And it was also easy to run the space. I focused more on the scale of commons, how I want to understand such infrastructures, how they're running and how scale matters in commoning, in practices of commoning.
- 00:34:09.91 I have last few slides to share and then I'm finished. This is why I'm so fast. I'm sorry. I started to think about different kinds of pedagogical experiments in different kinds of territories that those pedagogies can engage and activate communities. This is very important for me and I don't want to do it by myself. I want to do it collectively, because the only way that can work is through collective action, I believe. And here collective action, I refer again to Gibson and Graham.
- 00:34:53.87 Another experience was Silent University that was initiated by Ahmet Ögüt, artist, in London, when he was a residency in Tate Modern. And this was a difficult project. I'm a full-time, I was a full-time professor and then outside of academia I was running and still running the Silent University contributing in many places. But basically I was trying to establish Silent University, it has many branches and in Germany and in Stockholm. And I wanted to establish with some activist in Athens and also in Amman. And the Silent University doesn't have any budget.
- 00:35:43.71 I think Ahmet got a prize and put the prize money into that. And you will see in slide 30, we have cards, serious Silent University cards. And in slide 31, with Ahmet and Florian Malzacher we produced a Silent University book that gathers experiences from among Athens, Hamburg, London, Mülheim, and Stockholm. And this university is a kind of a platform, a crossing between academics, NGO workers, refugees. Is not only, in the beginning we told is only for refugees and run by refugees, but many NGO workers and different kinds of people who are engaged in alternative pedagogies, they wanted to engage with this project.
- 00:36:32.48 And so it's a kind of a mix right now. After this book, in slide 32 with Ahmet, we started to write principles and demands of Silent University. How to create a transversal pedagogy in that. It was very hard to establish in Athens and Amman the Silent University. We can discuss about that. Institutional structures are different than Western Europe. And in Europe it was really hard to run, in different Silent University workshops
- 00:37:09.17 In slide 33, this is Spaces of Solidarity. I collaborate a lot with artists and architects. I do a lot of

collective research. This is, in slide 33 you see Spaces of solidarity. I run it with Malkit Shoshan, architect. And we are collecting, and you will see in the research part, we are archiving many space-based solidarity practices.

- 00:37:39.85 In slide 34, I was invited to Oslo Architectural Triennial with Martha Rosler. If I get invited by biennials, I use the biennial as a platform. And here, in that case, the title of the biennial was called "After Belonging" and with Martha we came up with a kind of online infrastructure, interviewing different kinds of solidarity practices. These are all online and recorded. That was a time that there was no online teaching COVID situation.
- 00:38:22.58 My last two slides, 35. I am working with Magnus Ericson, run by IASPIS, under IASPIS. Public programming and a website and book called "Urgent Pedagogies." this is a map that we started. How in design, architecture and art, how those different methodologies create different kinds of forms of pedagogies and unlearning. This is what we are focusing on and trying to archive. I have many things to show, but I stop here. Thank you very much. Maybe we can go more through discussion. I feel very like, online, I hope it worked, I mean, with the slides and showing it.
- 00:39:24.68 **THOMAS KEENAN:** It worked.
- 00:39:25.33 **LAUREN CORNELL:** It was great, thank you Pelin.
- 00:39:27.02 **CAMILA PALOMINO:** It was great.
- 00:39:28.19 **PELIN TAN:** I was very fast because I wanted to show many things. I'm so sorry. We have limited time, I know. And I hope I was clear in what I'm doing. It's very confusing sometimes.
- 00:39:40.94 **THOMAS KEENAN:** It's OK. We can talk about it. We have time. I'll just say a couple of things and I have a couple of questions. I have pages and pages of notes but I'll boil them down to a couple of questions. I should say I'm living in Zoom university and there's another professor teaching in the same space here so her class may intrude on our class, if you hear something in the background. So I just wanted to underline a couple of things about, just about Pelin, for the for the class.
- 00:40:20.66 So a really militantly undisciplined or trans disciplinary approach, you are witnessing to here. Everything from architecture to art to gardening to theory to sociology, a lot of empirical work, but also a very strong theoretical armature organizing it. Very, I think, really hard to do and really important to do, not just to stay either as a sociologist or an architect or a curator. So I think it's really unusual and kind of amazing. Second, a strange either attraction to or accidentally finding oneself in places of conflict. And I think that would be interesting to discuss is how and why one operates in, you know, on borders like the Syrian-Turkish border or in camps or in occupied territory of one sort or another. That seems to be to be a really a recurrent feature of your work, that you find yourself in these places. And I think it would be interesting to talk about how that happens and why.
- 00:42:01.15 And then third, just kind of a framing thing to underline some recurrent but really understated figures in the talk that you've presented. So refugees, migrants and the places that they find themselves living in, whether it's camps or, I want to talk about the squatted hotel later in Greece. Refugees, food and gardens and women, women's work particularly. And I think you return to these with a very matter-of-fact attitude. It's not a big underlined proposition, but I think it's fascinating. And I would love to be able to talk about how these particular issues go through and structure some of the things that you work on.



- 00:43:12.71 So, but just to say, those were kind of general notes, things that struck me, as kind of... Maybe we could call them like, the infrastructure of some of what you were talking about here. But that's where I want to start. Just as a matter of clarification about this word "infrastructure" and why it's so important to you and to others. Let's act naive for a little bit and imagine that we haven't read Keller Easterling and we don't know all this. Why is it important to talk about infrastructure for you? What what is it? It seems like there are some other conversations out there, whether it's in architecture or curating or political theory even. And you want again and again to introduce this question of infrastructure. So my super naive question is, how come? What's at stake? Why is it important to pay attention to this layer of social reality?
- 00:44:23.24 I can continue, yeah? Camila? This is... I think, for me, there is a kind of a desire to understand... For example, if you occupy this hotel, if you go and in one night built, constructed tents and start to create a habitus. I come up always with the same question, what will happen the other day? I mean, the day after? And this is a kind of question that you manage autonomously. Let's think, you manage autonomously a habitus, a space, a collective life. But how are you going to sustain that? If I ask this question to myself, I come up directly to the definition of infrastructure.
- 00:45:34.43 **PELIN TAN:** I believe you need to sustain such a... I mean, first it attracts me because it's autonomous. In a larger perspective, it's not under oppression. You can you can give collective decision that is not bounded by state, not bounded by military, not bounded by colonizer. So this is a kind of a metaphorical thinking also, how we can relate ourselves and under justice and collectively we can occupy and live in a space by producing continuity and sustainability. And this is, I believe, it's based on what kind of infrastructure we're talking about.
- 00:46:26.37 For example, in Athens, City Plaza was an empty hotel that was bankrupt. So the owner was unable to run the hotel anymore and it was empty for a long time. And the activists, they had to accommodate those families and they occupied the space. It was so hard to run. I mean, occupying a space and accommodating yourself. Activists were living there, too. And then you have to find, the other day, the food. You have to find a school for the Syrian children. You don't have any source, you know. You don't have money, you don't have any support for, and is an anarchist act. There is no NGO or something that is helping to you. And in that case, how do you manage and sustain? How you can create? I mean, physically creating an infrastructure or finding an infrastructure is not so important.
- 00:47:20.94 The social relation and network and all those practices of commoning that is related to alternative economies and labor and so on. It is very important to define this infrastructure and run it and sustain it. They couldn't sustain after three years. I was there last March and they told me, Pelin this is the end because we are not able to find food anymore, and the families are also having different difficulties. There were many difficulties in decision-making. They had a lot of fights inside there, that I don't mention so much in the article. But it's not so easy to run an autonomous infrastructure in reality or thinking as metaphorically.
- 00:48:05.59 This is why, I think, to imagine and to discuss and to put in a discourse about infrastructure in any scale. I think is important because how is going to sustain, how it's going to create future further sociability is important for me. And this is why I came always with the question of infrastructure. In case of Silent University, for example, there is no real infrastructure. I mean, is a fictive school. But we have this card, and with identity card I can enter to MoMA, it works, this card. So it's very like between reality and unreality. There is a kind of a fictional part that you design, like Silent University and it can function that way. But for example, when I wanted to establish Silent University with activists who wanted to have a branch, because Silent University

always works, is a little informal. And you have to come up to Silent University saying that I want to run the branch and then we help, Ahmet and me helping them, who wants to do it.

00:49:23.14 So the Greek activists said we want to do it. And in a month they wanted to do it too. But they didn't have any West European art institution funding budget to do that. And they didn't have any place also to establish the Silent University. And in Athens, they were using the squats, refugee squat spaces. And in Amman, it was impossible. We were not able to succeed in establishing a Silent University branch there. So the institutional structure in specific places, in that case, you have to handle the means of infrastructure differently. In Athens, they wanted to run it as the mobile, in the squat spaces and outside of the Athens, in the camps as a kind of a mobile school, they came up, the activists. So it's very interesting that, how in different territory you face with different way of thinking and defining infrastructure. And also, for example, in Silent University artistic aesthetic is totally different. I can speak more about it, maybe.

00:50:48.68 **THOMAS KEENAN:** As I'm hearing you, the way you're understanding it is, there has actually been a lot of attention paid to infrastructure as this kind of, I think Easterling calls it "hidden substrate," all kinds of interventions that one might make, find themselves depending on or taking for granted infrastructures that kind of shape how the interventions can unfold. And you're interested in attending to that, but in not taking the existence of those infrastructures for granted, looking at the places where people are building them themselves or are hijacking existing abandoned ones or are in some DIY fashion generating them freshly. So it's that you're making a particular kind of intervention in the discussion about infrastructure. It's not just infrastructure as a whole. It's these particular kinds where what is generally invisible or behind the scene gets taken over by on-the-ground actors themselves. Is that right? Infrastructure becomes an activists' site?

00:52:06.32 **PELIN TAN:** Yes, I can give one example. For example, the process of the Yazidi camp near Mardin, the example I gave, that the Yazidi women were very active in the camp, in building the small design structures and spaces of the camp. This is something like in the in the architectural education, in the design studios, that is always... The architect is the designer who designs and finds solutions for emergency dwelling and urgent habitation. And the first thing is that, coming back, you first in defining me, that I'm finding myself in those places. Coincidentally, it was not a coincidence. I mean, the faculty of the architecture... Around the faculty were many camps. I mean, the bus station that was newly designed behind the faculty, the local regional bus station was 650 refugees from **[INAUDIBLE]** who arrived in one or two to nights by walking. They were accommodated immediately in the bus station. Everything what is happening is just happening around us. And is not a coincidence or, if you don't want to put it in your pedagogy. I mean, you have an institution and running and you have a structure of this institution and many social happening transformation is going on around your city and around your building. And of course, this is not that you find it in coincidence, it's just happening in front of your eyes and you are part of it.

00:54:02.08 And how to transfer it into pedagogical strategies, that was one of my aims. And secondly, I come back to this architectural design studios and architecture camps, they understand always that, as I said, how to design a camp, how urgently and this kind of solution is always upside down, is not so much grassroots, although they speak about participatory design. But in this case, I did a totally different, kind of a different strategy with the students. Of course, I'm lucky that my students speak Arabic and Kurdish, so it's very easy to communicate with immigrants. And I speak a little bit of Kurdish. I learned. I'm Turkish, I don't speak Kurdish and Arabic normally. Mostly all the governmental workers are administratives are Turkish, by the way.

- 00:55:01.00 And this is an important knowledge, I forgot to tell. But in this camp, it was very interesting to see how they are designing their solution, this DIY, you said, or grassroots way, and how we all can learn from it. I think this is... I want to say something more, but I forgot, maybe you continue and it will come up on my mind, maybe here.
- 00:55:30.45 **THOMAS KEENAN:** I'll just start right where you are, how you learn. I was fascinated by the repeated way your projects intervene in very sensitive spaces, whether it's the fishing villages that are getting obliterated or refugee camps or Temporary Autonomous Zones. And I felt like you must have built up a kind of methodology for how you do that in a way that's respectful, that's not exploitative, that is a demonstration of solidarity with the people who you're working on. I mean, there's so much discussion about participatory this and participatory that. And a lot of it seems really dubious. So what kind of sensibility have you crafted to make your way in these kind of spaces?
- 00:56:33.76 **PELIN TAN:** I think, recently, someone else, another researcher, asked me the same question and I had to reply to them, it was kind of a written interview. In social science and also in the urban research, there are many methodologies of engagement. And sometimes we use them like action research or a kind of grassroots participation. I mean, we know those focus groups or these kind of methodologies to engage with a community that you want to work. And either urban neighborhoods or refugees and so on, but I prefer not to use any existing methodologies. I use... When I go to the, when I am in these places, actually, I prefer to involve firstly in their everyday life.
- 00:57:50.40 This is how I start first. This is not so much a concrete aim, but I don't like to use these sociological methods or other kind of methodologies. And I like to... The first level is certainly action research, you know? If you if you can make them visible, their issues and their problems in a kind of a pragmatic way, they can really... You can, in one hand, you can collaborate with them and understand what is going on. This is important, I understand, but I don't feel myself and also my colleague, if I am with my students or either with other kinds of activists together, and it's not so much about helping... One second, I have... OK, I have little... I have to plug in.
- 00:57:50.40 And it's more like how we can create a collaboration through our own precariousness. This is what I'm trying to do, Thomas. I'm not an NGO worker and I'm not an artist to do work on that. I'm basically an educator. It's very important for me to put those issues in pedagogy, in an institution like academia. I believe in that and really change my students' mind, what they are thinking about architecture or what they're thinking about society, which is very segregated, in the case of Turkey, for example.
- 00:59:33.50 But it's important to think, to connect with other people through your own precariousness and then share the everyday life. Sometimes we call it research. We call it field, which is very problematic actually, because sometimes it's not a research, is not the field. I mean, you start something like that, but in the midway, you forget what you're doing, what you were researching. When I was in Pearl River Delta with the fishing women, we were just hanging out in the boats in the Pearl River Delta. And after a while, I just forgot what I was doing, what I was researching, what was my aim. You just get lost in the... And then you don't call it a field anymore or a research anymore. And the most important thing in academia, they want an outcome, an article or whatever. In artistic field they want a video and sometimes these kind of things. But then you are not able to produce anything about that and through that because you are totally sharing another kind of everyday life knowledge.
- 01:00:36.42 And this is the best way, really, to connect with your own way of precariousness, it's the most

important way to learn collectively. Is not about learning from them or they learn from you, as me as an intellectual person coming and working there. But it's more like how to really share collectively. And then, of course, the other level is, if it's in a pedagogical institution, the students get really changed. Not only about learning about self design in the camp, is not only about that, but is also about learning how they can think differently, about learning and research and field. This is also very important, I think.

01:01:36.09 **THOMAS KEENAN:** I really love your description of losing track of what you're doing in the boat. It sounds to me like you're describing some kind of surrender, like you go there as one thing and you... The losing track is also giving in to where you are and who you're with and the conversations that you're having. And that made me think about this term which you return to again and again, which is "solidarity."

01:02:06.44 **PELIN TAN:** Yeah, I was thinking of that right now.

01:02:09.41 **THOMAS KEENAN:** And I wonder how you understand that and how you would differentiate a practice of solidarity from various other, let's say, styles of political engagement. I mean, it's related to a discourse about human rights but it's not exactly the same thing. It has a certain kind of sense of democracy in it, but it's not the same thing. So I wonder how you understand what these acts of solidarity are.

01:02:42.83 **PELIN TAN:** This is what I was thinking right now before I stopped, after I stopped because...

01:02:48.78 **THOMAS KEENAN:** That's a good sign.

01:02:49.79 **PELIN TAN:** Because I was thinking that when you asked the previous question, it's also very obvious that it relates, I mean, personally and also with my collectives and people, it's about solidarity. You know, you care that you want those fisherwomen and men not to lose their everyday life and not to lose their way of fishing in the in the Pearl River Delta and China Sea and not to lose their ways of reproduction, what they are, what they are producing in their everyday life. And this is something that you run to engage with them because you want that, under this whole big infrastructure project of the river transportation network, highways and bridges, you want to you, have a feeling to save, you want to be with them and share.

01:04:03.36 And this is a kind, of course, at the end it's about solidarity. But solidarity became recently a very problematic practice that I myself was not able to define anymore. And solidarity was very much belonging to those... One second, I have to plug in. It was very much about a language, a discourse that was used by NGOs a lot. It was used a lot in alternative struggle and social movements. And solidarity is, I feel is not only the practical thing that you do. I mean, be in the street with Gypsy Romani neighborhoods in Istanbul, against the police, you know? This is solidarity, physically being in the street.

01:05:02.54 And is not only creating a campaign to collect money for COVID workers. I think solidarity is also about kind of sharing collectively how to produce different kinds of infrastructures. And so I think solidarity became so much, I mean, this concept, the term, became so much under discussion too in the last two, three years. I came across a lot and especially in the art scene is being discussed a lot. And I think this being in solidarity is very much about interdependency. You know, how we can create interdependency in labor, interdependency in everyday life, and how we can redefine solidarity through that. I mean, there's a several levels. I see pedagogical structure that I'm trying to create a kind of solidarity practice. I feel that alternative knowledge production is very much about collectivity, about solidarity too. All we have to think and I'm

thinking that way, I'm trying to think, and we have to think in that way, I'm feeling.

- 01:06:30.02 **THOMAS KEENAN:** That opens up lots of more questions. But I think maybe I'll give it back to Camila because I'm sure there are plenty of questions in the room here too.
- 01:06:39.18 **CAMILA PALOMINO:** Thank you so much you two. Thank you Pelin for your presentation. It's been really amazing to see all the projects that you've been working on, sort of like in context of a lot of the conversations we've been having in class. So it's really great to focus on the specific projects. I'm wondering if anybody has any questions now, if anybody wants to jump in. Ok, I can go ahead, I have a question so far, for you two. Because I've been thinking a lot about, in this moment that we're in now, in the global pandemic, I think that collectively this question of time and uncertainty and this kind of conception of time and duration is being felt collectively questioned.
- 01:07:42.53 And as you were mentioning, Tom, I think something in Pelin's practice that you were noting was this kind of going to these precarious situations and places and borders where time is also experienced differently. So I was wondering how you're kind of thinking about that in this moment, in your research and how time is kind of structured in these transitory spaces and through self-organization. I'm also curious because you mentioned that the refugee camp, the Çınar camp no longer existed. So I was wondering if you could talk about that kind of timeframe that you were working in to complete your research and to engage with the community.
- 01:08:40.60 **PELIN TAN:** Camila, I'm trying to understand your question.. You're asking about the timeframe, isn't it? I mean, how... I think this is very important because I think about that a lot, too. I have to, maybe say something in the beginning about that. To be in this kind of territory, the most difficult thing is that everything can be changed in one night. Everything changed very fast. And this has...
- 01:09:17.46 We can discuss it in two sides. I mean, one is that you engage with new knowledge of people that they are producing and you want to be collectively part of that. But everything is so fast changing. This camp was one year, one a half years. In one night, it was destroyed by the government. And then we had, for example, we had to figure out where the families that we were close, where they are transported, you know? And then we found out they transported into a state-run camp near Mardin.
- 01:09:54.37 So you lost the contact. We had a little mobile phone contacts and so on. So, for example, another... I met a Kurdish family in **[INAUDIBLE]** We became friends, we met again in Athens, they moved to Athens. And we met several times and always their condition of, official condition, also living condition was changing so fast. And you have to really understand that firstly, the community that you engage are under fast affects. But also, as a researcher, yourself too, as a practitioner, too. I mean, you have to be always also aware that if some obstacle can happen... I mean, for example, I was sued by the government once. I had the court, I was in the criminal court for one year, they wanted to arrest and so on, which is very, very normal. Most people have this in Turkey right now who are engaged in such kind of research. I mean, in Europe it will sound very bizarre, but in Turkey, we're just living with this kind of reality. But many things changed so quickly. And then you have to really fast find manners to adapt. In one thing, if you are collectively researching or engaged, it is very interdependency. I talked about means of solidarity. Then it becomes very, I don't want to say easy, but somehow possible to adapt those timeframes and continue, do more research and continue in a different level, in a different space. For example, maybe I should tell through a example. This families, when we lost them, when they are destroyed in one night because there was a conflict between Kurdish municipality

and Turkish government. The region, the region is... The governor is the ruling party, the mayors are Kurdish from another party and the mayors, the municipalities were supporting the self-organized camp and the government doesn't want that. So this is why they were destroyed in one night and evicted. So in that sense, you have to really quickly transform yourself to find out where they are and transform the whole means of solidarity in a different format. And it sounds very difficult if I say something like that, but if you live in this kind of places, it becomes a kind of a daily survival. So you race with time and you get adaptable. But it's a kind of obstacle, of course.

01:11:13.23 **THOMAS KEENAN:** I would just say, Camila, to your question, that I think it's a version, a more condensed version of what Pelin is saying. It seems to me that we're in a very... The temporality of now is not just one temporality. There's a lot of waiting and a lot of kind of empty, quiet time. There's a lot for us. I mean, this is only speaking for myself or for people in the Zoom school. You know, there's a lot of bubbling inside this environment where differences get blurred pretty quickly, differences between this time and another time.

01:13:56.69 But at the same time... "At the same time", there's a urgency and an emergency temporality as well, that seems to... Where waiting is the enemy and action now on all kinds of fronts seems like the most important thing. And I feel myself kind of, it's not even shuttling, just kind of jerked back and forth between these different experiences of time at the moment. But I think you're absolutely right to identify that as the central concept of what we're in right now.

01:14:38.24 **PELIN TAN:** Yeah, Camila, I'm sorry, I forgot the first part of your question. I was focused... Because I was thinking myself also about time. I'm sorry I missed your first part of the question, but I don't have answers. I don't have an answer for the COVID situation.

01:14:58.06 **CAMILA PALOMINO:** Thank you. Yeah, I'm wondering, does anybody have other questions?

01:15:11.85 **MUHEB ESMAT:** I have a question for Pelin. Yeah, can you guys hear me? I think we have had this conversation before, and just like you talk in class and here and this idea of what Tom was pointing out too, the spaces you work in, like places like post-war, which obviously even the post, like you have to understand where or how long that's been, like, how do we define post-war? Because some wars continue without the guns. So how do you take that into consideration? Is how do you do solidarity and care if there is no justice? How is it? Have you felt like, kind of that being a problem or that being something that stops people or is like a wall? I don't know. Maybe that's to me, just it seems like something too. Very important things that one of them should come first.

01:16:19.20 **PELIN TAN:** One of them comes first means, which one?

01:16:21.49 **MUHEB ESMAT:** Is like, the justice in the sense if there's no justice...

01:16:25.10 **PELIN TAN:** Yeah, Muheb, I understand what you mean. I mean, injustice is very... Injustice is invested in the territory, you know? There is injustice that we never saw and it doesn't really exist... I understand what you say and how the solidarity can be created. Oh, I don't know. There was one thing. My Master's students, my Kurdish students, they lost their jobs and they lost their profession, two years ago. There was a specific lawsuit that the Turkish government has really erased some Kurdish activists. I mean, even my students are Master's students, female, working in the Kurdish municipalities. They lost their job and everything and like everything, no job, no diploma. You cannot continue as an architect and urban planner anymore. And your passport stopped. You cannot also go outside of Turkey. So basically, the Turkish government ask you to

suicide.

- 01:17:38.382 And one research assistant, teaching assistant, I don't know him, but we know in the news, he suicided. He killed himself because he had nothing left. So it happened to my students too. My colleagues, I will say, because they finished their Master with me and we are working. I didn't know what to do. I immediately created a kind of research platform that we started to work even more together because I cannot get their jobs back. I don't have the power. I cannot get... Maybe I can find a little project and money. But the most important was that they felt so useless psychologically. You cannot do anything anymore and there is nothing, and they are only 25, 26 years old, you know?
- 01:18:32.53 And immediately we started to work more together, doing more workshops, doing more field research. We are producing a book now together. And then they told me they felt much better since one, two years. And so you just... It's a personal thing, you just use your own personal power or career, how to turn into an advantage for them. And yeah, this is the care and solidarity that you can produce. Of course, there will be no justice and they will not going to be any justice, especially if I'm speaking for my country or in another. There is no... I don't have any hope for that. But I'm just thinking how we create small, meaningful care infrastructures. This is what I'm interested and I'm trying to do.
- 01:19:38.35 **THOMAS KEENAN:** I would just add that I'm not sure if I'm as pessimistic as Pelin, but I haven't lived in Turkey for most of my life.
- 01:19:46.24 **PELIN TAN:** Good for you!
- 01:19:48.64 **THOMAS KEENAN:** But I would say solidarity and care...
- 01:19:50.61 **PELIN TAN:** But I want to say, Thomas, everywhere, I guess, is like that. I don't want to marginalize my situation and speak through that, but I think it is very much in every country and city right now, who wants to really look for real justice. I'm sorry to interrupt you.
- 01:20:12.57 **THOMAS KEENAN:** I would just resist slightly the idea that solidarity and care are kind of, I don't know, like soft compromise practices as opposed to "real justice" or something hard and definitive. It feels to me like there's a very complex relation between those different practices. And sometimes solidarity and care are pathways or ways toward a justice which might otherwise be blocked at the legal or the political level. I think there are deep ways in which particularly actions of political solidarity can be gestures of justice in themselves and ways around obstacles to justice achieved by more conventional means. So I don't think it's about settling for caring as opposed to, you know, lining up the bad guys and shooting them. I think it's a much more variegated landscape there.
- 01:21:22.74 **PELIN TAN:** Yeah. I mean, justice is an institutional practice, and has to be really taken by the states, at first, to really establish basic forms of justice. I mean, people can speak their own language, be free to speak their own language and people shouldn't be arrested.
- 01:21:59.37 **THOMAS KEENAN:** You are talking about law, though.
- 01:22:01.22 **PELIN TAN:** Law. Yes, yes, there's law, I'm sorry.
- 01:22:03.87 **THOMAS KEENAN:** There's a well-known gap between law and justice.

asuicide.

00:49:23.14

And one research assistant, teaching assistant, I don't know him, but we know in the news, he suicided. He killed himself because he had nothing left. So it happened to my students too. My colleagues, I will say, because they finished their Master with me and we are working. I didn't know what to do. I immediately created a kind of research platform that we started to work even more together because I cannot get their jobs back. I don't have the power. I cannot get... Maybe I can find a little project and money. But the most important was that they felt so useless psychologically. You cannot do anything anymore and there is nothing, and they are only 25, 26 years old, you know?

00:50:48.68

And immediately we started to work more together, doing more workshops, doing more field research. We are producing a book now together. And then they told me they felt much better since one, two years. And so you just... It's a personal thing, you just use your own personal power or career, how to turn into an advantage for them. And yeah, this is the care and solidarity that you can produce. Of course, there will be no justice and they will not going to be any justice, especially if I'm speaking for my country or in another. There is no... I don't have any hope for that. But I'm just thinking how we create small, meaningful care infrastructures. This is what I'm interested and I'm trying to do.

**THOMAS KEENAN:** I would just add that I'm not sure if I'm as pessimistic as Pelin, but I haven't lived in Turkey for most of my life.

**PELIN TAN:** Good for you!

00:52:06.32

**THOMAS KEENAN:** But I would say solidarity and care...

**PELIN TAN:** But I want to say, Thomas, everywhere, I guess, is like that. I don't want to marginalize my situation and speak through that, but I think it is very much in every country and city right now, who wants to really look for real justice. I'm sorry to interrupt you.

**THOMAS KEENAN:** I would just resist slightly the idea that solidarity and care are kind of, I don't know, like soft compromise practices as opposed to "real justice" or something hard and definitive. It feels to me like there's a very complex relation between those different practices. And sometimes solidarity and care are pathways or ways toward a justice which might otherwise be blocked at the legal or the political level. I think there are deep ways in which particularly actions of political solidarity can be gestures of justice in themselves and ways around obstacles to justice achieved by more conventional means. So I don't think it's about settling for caring as opposed to, you know, lining up the bad guys and shooting them. I think it's a much more variegated landscape there.

00:54:02.08

**PELIN TAN:** Yeah. I mean, justice is an institutional practice, and has to be really taken by the states, at first, to really establish basic forms of justice. I mean, people can speak their own language, be free to speak their own language and people shouldn't be arrested.

**THOMAS KEENAN:** You are talking about law, though.

**PELIN TAN:** Law. Yes, yes, there's law, I'm sorry.

**THOMAS KEENAN:** There's a well-known gap between law and justice.



- 01:22:07.14 **PELIN TAN:** Yes. Yes. There is a huge gap. I'm speaking more, when I speak about care and solidarity it's more like minor acts of, I don't want to say establishing justice, but a kind of care and being, the feeling of being together under injustice. To not to disappear, otherwise people will disappear, physically and mentally.
- 01:22:49.81 **CAMILA PALOMINO:** On this question of solidarity, I wanted to ask about something that you mentioned before, Tom. When you were discussing solidarity within Pelin's practice, you mentioned that solidarity doesn't really fall within kind of, maybe I misheard you, but it was like, it doesn't really fall within the kind of sphere of human rights. And I was wondering if you could speak more to that.
- 01:23:14.02 **THOMAS KEENAN:** That's a seminar in itself. But the maybe a short version would be... I mean, there are considerable overlaps and you can make an argument that human rights language is a form of solidarity. That the notion of identifying something that you share with another and claiming it as proper to both of you is a kind of core structure of human rights to the notion that I don't just claim a right for myself. If I claim a right, I'm claiming it for everybody. And that can be an act of solidarity in one sense.
- 01:23:50.46 But going back to the history, the relatively recent history of the human rights movement, there has been a big split between so-called solidarity movements and human rights movements. So solidarity in that sense is when you decide that one of the parties in a conflict, whether it's the civil rights movement or a struggle against dictatorship in Nicaragua or whatever, you decide that one side is right and the other side is wrong and you are in solidarity with one of those sides.
- 01:24:20.77 So it's a it's a strongly partisan non... It's not like everybody is the same here. There are there are those whose side you're on and there are those who you're fighting against. And that's often a component of a solidarity gesture. Whereas human rights is, you know, a very... It's an equalizing and kind of relativizing discourse. It says everybody has rights. That the victim has rights, but so does the perpetrator. And that's another way of establishing a bond. But it's not exactly the bond of solidarity. So I think there are moments when it overlaps and moments when it's very different. And you need to be careful when you're invoking big categories like rights and solidarity to make sure that you kind of are somewhat in control of the context where you're invoking them. That's what I was gesturing to. You can play the same game with democracy and with a bunch of other nicknames for political practices. But I think that the tension and the overlap is very clear between solidarity movements and human rights movements.
- 01:25:32.81 **CAMILA PALOMINO:** Thank you. Does anybody have any other questions?
- 01:25:42.18 **NATASHA MATTESON:** I have a question. Can you guys hear me? OK, so this is sort of a follow up question from Camila's question about this particular moment and how it's operating differently. I guess I just wanted to think about how we're situated in academia right now. And to whatever extent this may be a state of exception, insofar as quick moves can be made by governments that then become prolonged and the sense of a need to act or urgency that Tom mentioned alongside this kind of odd in-between time. I'm wondering whether or how you are each thinking about the relationship between academia and activism during this specific moment, if there is any. And I know both of your practices are not just confined to academia. Thank you.
- 01:26:46.37 **PELIN TAN:** I can say a little bit about that, because I feel very connected to academia and I was always in the academic, as an institution, in academia. And I want to be in the academia. I mean, activism and academia in Turkey are really together. Actually, activism, academia and terrorism

is together. We are in a moment that they are calling us terrorists in Turkey. So it's an extreme example in Turkey that how academics are, in what situation they are. There is a general global level of academics in an institution, either private institution, private university or national university. I don't know if you have this difference, we have it. And there's a kind of global problems with neoliberalism and expressing your ideas in academia. And also there's a problem of many institutional processing in academia, and it's just a little bit global. You can see it in Germany, you can see it in the US and is a repetition of symptoms of many recent contemporary academic universities, as academic you have a lot of precarious condition. And this is something general.

01:28:17.77 And then there are kind of local conditions like in Turkey, that you are really in danger. I mean, they follow in your emails that you cannot really express. They arrest you, they present you and so on. So it's a very more severe level. But I think the universities are dying, at least in Turkey. But I think it's so important to be insist. Me, personally speaking, in the institution, university is my place and run it and do it with my colleagues, how we want to do it and continue in that way. And I'm really defending that. Although I have a lot of groups outside of academia, outside of university. I believe that this knowledge production has to change. I'm speaking from an architecture, arts, discipline. There are many other disciplines, I'm sure. There are many conservative sides. There is many conservative side of understanding social issues, justice and so on. And it's naive to say but you can have a lot of impact on undergrad students to make them aware of injustice conditions, to make them aware of everything that is related to humans, to climate and so on. And I personally believe that is our place as an academic, I personally want to get back to space. And this institution that I was running in Mardin, I want to run it again. I don't get tired of that.

01:30:17.25 **THOMAS KEENAN:** I just say, Natasha, it's a great question. There are lots of different academic spaces, I would insist on the principle of the non monolith here. And I think people in academia are experiencing this in really radically different ways and we need to pay attention to that. On the one hand, a lot of people are losing their jobs. I have friends who for whom this crisis has cost them their jobs. Universities are going to close, for sure, because of this. Not just closed for part of the semester, but there will be attrition here. So on the one hand, there's lots to sort of defend and protect and protest about there. On the other hand, you know, of all the sectors of the economy, to speak crudely, that can move to an online world relatively easily, ours is up there. And so I think that's another way in which this is happening is that, you know, we don't

01:04:03.36 actually have to leave our house to continue going to school to teach and learn. So that's that's a little different, too. And we should probably pay attention to that. And I think that the academic space does give us a platform or various kinds of platforms to make claims about how other parts of the political life are responding to the crisis. I think there's a way in which the university now is kind of a unusually new politicized space, where making claims about ethics and equity, but also making claims about science and truths are important and possible. And they have more resonance than they might have at other times. So I think it's kind of a really mixed picture there.

01:32:37.53 **CAMILA PALOMINO:** Thank you. I just want to be conscious of our time.

01:32:43.06 **THOMAS KEENAN:** Yeah, I'm running a little over here and...

01:32:45.72 **PELIN TAN:** Yeah, me too, I have another meeting.

01:32:50.99 **CAMILA PALOMINO:** So I guess we'll wrap up now. Thank you so much you two for joining us. And thank you everybody who Zoomed in.

01:33:01.08 **PELIN TAN:** Thank you very much.

01:33:02.65 **CAMILA PALOMINO:** I'm excited to continue these conversations.

01:33:05.71 **PELIN TAN:** Thank you, Thomas, also.

01:33:07.23 **THOMAS KEENAN:** It's great to talk, I wish I were there.

01:33:12.98 **PELIN TAN:** Thank you. Bye bye. Thank you.